

Discussion:

**Through Drought and Flood: The Past, Present and Future
of Climate Migration**

by Elías Albagli, Pablo García Silva, Gonzalo García-Trujillo, María Antonia Yung
– discussant: Anouch Missirian

November 28, 2023

A quick summary of the paper and its contributions

What has been, is, will be, the effect of short-/medium-term weather variations on migration and conflict? In this paper:

- **The past** (from millennia BC to the 90s) provides motivating examples of environmental shocks leading to migration and regime shifts;
- **The present** (1990-2020) is analysed to uncover a weather-migration relationship;
- **The future** (2020-2100) is explored using the above on IPCC trajectories.

⇒ Highlight (confirm) present and past influence of environmental fluctuations on the stability of societies and migration.

⇒ Projected *decline* in emigration *stock*, despite an increase in tropical and arid country-born emigrants (moderate warming).

⇒ Tipping point scenario (collapse of AMOC) forthcoming.

The past – My own favorite references

- 1) “The year without a summer” (e.g., Grabbe, 1989; Luterbacher and Pfister, 2015)



The past – My own favorite references

1) “The year without a summer” (e.g., [Grabbe, 1989](#); [Luterbacher and Pfister, 2015](#))



2) Onset of the Syrian civil war ([Kelley et al., 2015](#))

But also: [Iyigun et al. \(2017\)](#) and probably others.

The present / future

- How was temperature aggregated over space?
- Are stocks of emigrants from country X the relevant variable here? Specifically:
 - We typically think of migration, e.g. in the context of weather shocks, as a *flow*;
 - It's more complex to unpack the evolution of a stock: new people migrate (in), adding to the existing migrants (stock $t-1$), people leave, get naturalized, or die (out). What are we picking up?
 - “Emigrants” are an incredibly protean group.

The present / future

- How was temperature aggregated over space?
- Are stocks of emigrants from country X the relevant variable here? Specifically:
 - We typically think of migration, e.g. in the context of weather shocks, as a *flow*;
 - It's more complex to unpack the evolution of a stock: new people migrate (in), adding to the existing migrants (stock $t-1$), people leave, get naturalized, or die (out). What are we picking up?
 - "Emigrants" are an incredibly protean group.
- GDP: buffer effect or symptom of structural transformation?
- Weather shock \rightsquigarrow GDP implied by "past" segment but not considered in the "present" (hence "future") segment(s)?

The present / future

- How was temperature aggregated over space?
- Are stocks of emigrants from country X the relevant variable here? Specifically:
 - We typically think of migration, e.g. in the context of weather shocks, as a *flow*;
 - It's more complex to unpack the evolution of a stock: new people migrate (in), adding to the existing migrants (stock $t-1$), people leave, get naturalized, or die (out). What are we picking up?
 - "Emigrants" are an incredibly protean group.
- GDP: buffer effect or symptom of structural transformation?
- Weather shock \rightsquigarrow GDP implied by "past" segment but not considered in the "present" (hence "future") segment(s)?
- Are the short-term, somewhat moderate variations in temperatures/precipitations used in the regressions suited to model reactions to the brutal changes an AMOC collapse might bring about?

Ambition

An important issue addressed from multiples angles:

- Original use of a narrative approach as motivation/literature review;
- Empirical approach confirms Missirian and Schlenker (2017) with different data...
- ... and tests a mediating effect of GDP.

Further

Suggestions to improve the contributions:

- Perhaps streamline the narratives (use maps?) and substitute certain case studies (however interesting) for others more closely connected to the variables of interest;
- Normalize by population (regressions), account for population growth (extrapolations)?
- Use the 5-year time step more?
- Preferred regression specification is column (4)'s ([Auffhammer et al., 2013](#));
- Account for the possibility of an effect of weather directly on GDP (e.g., use GDP_0).
- Really excited about the AMOC collapse scenario.

Thank you!

Appendix

Bibliography i

- M. Auffhammer, S. M. Hsiang, W. Schlenker, and A. Sobel. Using Weather Data and Climate Model Output in Economic Analyses of Climate Change. *Review of Environmental Economics and Policy*, 7(2):181–198, 2013. ISSN 1750-6816. doi: 10.1093/reep/ret016.
- J. Baez, G. Caruso, and V. Mueller. Droughts augment youth migration in Northern Latin America and the Caribbean. *Climatic Change*, 140: 423–435, 2017. ISSN 0165-0009. doi: 10.1007/s10584-016-1863-2. URL <http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10584-016-1863-2>.
- S. Chen, P. Oliva, and P. Zhang. NBER WORKING PAPER SERIES THE EFFECT OF AIR POLLUTION ON MIGRATION: EVIDENCE FROM CHINA The Effect of Air Pollution on Migration: Evidence from China. 2017. URL <http://www.nber.org/papers/w24036>.
- H.-J. Grabbe. European Immigration to the United States in the Early National Period, 1783-1820. *Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society*, 133(2):190–214, 1989.
- M. Iyigun, N. Nunn, and N. Qian. Winter is coming: The long-run effects of climate change on conflict, 1400-1900. *NBER Working Paper*, (January):51p, 2017.
- C. P. Kelley, S. Mohtadi, M. A. Cane, R. Seager, and Y. Kushnir. Climate change in the Fertile Crescent and implications of the recent Syrian drought. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, 112(11):3241–3246, 2015. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1421533112.
- J. Luterbacher and C. Pfister. The year without a summer. *Nature Geoscience*, 8(4):246–248, 2015. ISSN 1752-0894. doi: 10.1038/ngeo2404.
- A. Missirian and W. Schlenker. Asylum applications respond to temperature fluctuations. *Science*, 358(6370):1610–1614, 2017. ISSN 0036-8075. doi: 10.1126/science.aao0432.
- V. Mueller, C. L. Gray, and K. Kosec. Heat Stress Increases Long-term Human Migration in Rural Pakistan. *Nature Climate Change*, 4(3):182–185, 2014. ISSN 1758-678X. doi: 10.1038/nclimate2103.

- E. Piguet. Linking climate change, environmental degradation, and migration: a methodological overview. *Wiley Interdisciplinary Reviews: Climate Change*, 1(4):517–524, 2010.
- E. Piguet. From "Primitive Migration" to "Climate Refugees": The Curious Fate of the Natural Environment in Migration Studies. *Annals of the Association of American Geographers*, 103(14):148–162, 2013.
- E. Piguet and F. Laczko. *People on the Move in a Changing Climate. The Regional Impact of Environmental Change on Migration*. Springer, Dordrecht; New York, 2014. ISBN 9789400769847.
- J. Proctor, S. M. Hsiang, J. A. Burney, M. Burke, and W. Schlenker. Estimating the agricultural impacts of geoengineering using volcanic eruptions as natural experiments. *Nature*, 560(7719):480–483, 2018. ISSN 0028-0836. doi: 10.1038/s41586-018-0417-3.